

Dr. JoAnn Moody
Mentoring Students: Good and Bad Practices
September 21st, 2010

Attendance

146 individuals attended and 121 completed evaluations.

- Five individuals reported being staff members, 100 individuals reported being faculty, 9 individuals reported they were administrators, 4 reported they were “other,” and 4 did not report their role at NDSU

Quantitative Results from the Evaluation Form

I will be able to use the information that I learned today in my work at NDSU

		Frequency	Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Disagree	4	3.3	3.3
	Disagree	13	10.7	14.2
	2.50	1	.8	15.0
	Agree	65	53.3	69.2
	Strongly Agree	37	30.3	100.0
	Missing Data	2	1.6	
Total		122	100.0	

I feel I have acquired new skills, information, or understanding about mentoring students.

		Frequency	Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Disagree	6	4.9	5.0
	Disagree	17	13.9	19.0
	2.50	1	.8	19.8
	Agree	74	60.7	81.0
	Strongly Agree	23	18.9	100.0
	Missing Data	1	.8	
Total		122	100.0	

I will be able to implement new strategies and knowledge as a result of my participation in this lecture.

		Frequency	Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Disagree	6	4.9	5.0
	Disagree	18	14.8	20.2
	Agree	73	59.8	81.5
	Strongly Agree	22	18.0	100.0
	Missing Data	3	2.5	
Total		122	100.0	

I would recommend this lecture series to others

		Frequency	Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Disagree	4	3.3	3.4
	Disagree	18	14.8	18.8
	Agree	58	47.5	68.4
	Strongly Agree	37	30.3	100.0
	Missing Data	5	4.1	
Total		122	100.0	

Rate the overall quality of this lecture

		Frequency	Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Poor	5	4.1	4.4
	Below Average	10	8.2	13.2
	Average	48	39.3	55.3
	Above Average	39	32.0	89.5
	Excellent	12	9.8	100.0
	Missing Data	8	6.6	
Total		122	100.0	

Qualitative Results from the Evaluation Form

1. What questions do you still have after attending this lecture? Please list any areas that you would like to receive additional information about or that need further clarification.
 - How can faculty relate stereotype threat to privilege-oppression? How can Ted begin to understand his White, male privilege? Based on discussion, how can a student who experiences racism not take it personally? (Doesn't seem possible).
 - More concrete best practices.
 - How to recognize and play up positive stereotypes.
 - Why international students are not "susceptible to stereotype threat" per the handout?
 - Still unsure how to advise a student with mediocre grades, unimpressive standardized test scores, and uncertain goals.
 - What do you do when a leader on campus makes culturally insensitive remarks that affect and are targeted to students?
 - It would have been nice to have more handouts/solid info about mentoring students.
 - I'm really interested in reducing stereotyped threat about competency. For example, how do you/one make the vulnerable (those being stereotyped) become more comfortable?
 - Difference in mentoring/advising/counseling. I think the student in the example may have some mental health issues not addressed by stereotype threat maybe depression.
 - Positive stereotype of a 'college graduate' aka what should students know and how should they behave. Pulling up the ladder—relate to instructors having higher expectations than the instructor would have endured.
 - It was difficult at first to tie handout one with handout two, but I do understand the connection. Title is a little misleading.
 - It would have been nice to have a shorter discussion with more focus on take-home message and techniques. The problems were already familiar to me, but the solutions tend to be unclear and difficult.
 - The solo phenomenon. How to deal with solo women, minorities, etc.
 - Not enough into on mentoring- especially if your discussion group did not discuss much advising.
 - How do you train the students in your class not to stereotype others.
 - Are booklets available for purchase/distribute?
 - Speaker referenced Claude Steele at end—would have been useful to have more uniform info about this if it was to be an important component.
 - There was really no concrete information about mentoring given.
 - More general strategies for mentoring, particularly mentoring graduate students.
 - Some problems have no solutions. Like racial discrimination in a person's mind. (If there is a solution from human society, we, at this country, should have already known, and eliminated this problem).
 - More information on how to provide efficient guidance for students (→ maybe "scenarios" for such meeting?)
 - There is a need for large-scale training on mentoring. The tables with discussion on positive points of the scenario see mentoring in a much different light than the rest of the group seemed. This bias plays out in workloads in departments.
 - Perhaps an NDSU subgroup could discuss/address creating & fostering a more student-friendly (equality, fairness of treatment) campus.
 - A list of good & bad practices with regards to mentoring students.
 - I still want to learn about best practices in mentoring all students, not just minority students.

- Speaker is out of touch with reality that domestic (minority & majority) students are disappearing from graduate schools in science disciplines. Federal agencies recognize this problem.
 - The last statement on the summary document about non-native, immigrant students.
 - How do I get students to come and seek help?
 - Best practices.
 - How to mentor students while keeping personal experience bias out of it.
 - Some academic presentation with actual learning.
 - How do we train students to seek other help when they are treated in this way?
 - Would have liked more specific suggestions for how to mentor graduate as well as undergraduate students. Nuts and bolts advice was what I thought we were getting but didn't ☹.
 - I'd like those articles on supporting students as they deal with people stereotyping them.
 - Is there a "cheatsheet" for advising?
 - Very uninformative! Dr. Moody shot from hip and took to session whenever the ball dropped.
 - Summary and conclusion of seminar was [illegible]. The info concerning student mentoring was not delivered.
2. What do you think were the most helpful or valuable aspects of the lecture you attended today?
- USELESS- Not very useful.
 - Interactive participation.
 - The active learning exercise about Ted & Dwayne and subsequent discussion.
 - Suggestions for strategies.
 - The summary sheet on "Stereotype threat." This is a concept I was unfamiliar with prior to today.
 - To be more encouraging to students, table discussion was engaging.
 - Chatting with colleagues.
 - Awareness.
 - It was great to hear that my missteps can benefit students.
 - Small group discussion—hearing ideas from the rest of the table that I hadn't thought of.
 - The case study was a decent means of inspiring discussion.
 - Discovering that even "positive stereotypes" have an impact.
 - The solo phenomenon and what goes with it. Also the info about telling stories of failures and determination to inspire students.
 - Discussion with colleagues; understanding power of suggestion.
 - Talking with table-mates about the interaction. And identifying what would work.
 - Heightened awareness of the importance of listening, stepping out of the role of expert—as the mentor and learn from the student.
 - Getting to know more people.
 - Discussion with other members of table.
 - Working with others.
 - Table discussion.
 - Good reinforcement of social and personal factors that affect performance.
 - Table discussion.
 - The first handout. Downhill after that.
 - Learned how to deal with "stereotype threat."
 - The review of stereotype threat.
 - Example. Handouts.
 - Discussion at the table.
 - Chance to talk with others at my table, networking with others.
 - Refresher- initiated self-reflection.
 - The opportunity to work with people at our table to network & learn from each other.
 - Discussion was good.
 - Stereotype threats. Solo phenomenon.
 - Working in groups was a good activity.
 - Group discussion very useful, relevant. Interactiveness nice for after lunch.
 - Scenario.

- Table discussion of scenarios.
 - Stereotype threat handout.
 - Discussion of advising scenario with other faculty members and information on the best/most valuable role models (those who can disclose failure).
 - Discussing scenarios with colleagues at the table allowed me to (re)interpret some assumptions of how faculty-student relationships work.
 - I know I'm 40% of Ted.
 - Idea of "Stereotype threat" forming.
 - Get to know others from other areas in the university.
 - Helpful introduction to professor as mentor to undergrads.
 - Dr. Moody's evaluation talk after we have read & discussed the example at the table.
 - The table mixing was good.
 - Good discussion at tables.
 - Table discussion.
 - Had to leave early but I appreciate the discussion based approach.
 - Discussion and opinions from colleagues.
 - Some people at my table seemed to learn something new about ethnic/racial stereotyping.
 - I think the case study was useful for understanding importance of sensitivity to race and gender.
 - Table discussion that allowed exchange of opinions.
 - Well-organized for small & large group discussion.
 - 1) Group discussions were helpful in hearing about different perspectives of student mentoring. 2) Synopsis from the presenter was helpful too.
 - The summary.
 - Eye-opening.
 - Group work.
 - Specific examples.
 - To think about how what I am saying sounds to the student.
 - Discussion around the table.
 - It is practical & beneficial across disciplines, making us sit at assigned tables & meet new people is good.
 - Reinforcing that stereotype threat is real. We've heard this from other FORWARD speakers. But it's good to hear again.
 - Recognition of complexities.
 - I thought it was supposed to be about mentoring grad students.
 - Nothing—total waste of time. Lunch was good.
 - To see other people, and talk to them.
 - Discussion at the table was valuable & insightful.
3. How could the FORWARD lecture series be improved to be more beneficial to you? What recommendations do you have for future lectures?
- Too much information for the short time we had for the luncheon.
 - Get citations for faculty that can be used to help students overcome inferiorities.
 - It would be great to see programs that implement the advice that our speakers give. FORWARD does it, but more would be good.
 - Bring in grad students or undergrads from programs that have been successful—not just people in charge.
 - A more ambiguous discussion topic without such a clear evaluation.
 - Work directly with the diversity office on these issues—don't assume they know how to be culturally sensitive.
 - Maybe advance reading and information about topic.
 - The elements of choice. Do external standards affect the choices of women into careers. Are we really free to choose??
 - Many staff would be interested in this, but are usually not invited to attend. (Role on campus includes teaching.)

- Since Dr. Moody talked while we were supposed to be reading the handout (in every session!) she forced us to do a dual task, similar to what paragraph 2 talks about.
- A more formal lecture followed by activities would have better.
- Get other speakers like J. Moody who get group to interact & learn together.
- Provide more information about how to address short comings of Ted. Although group activity was good, less time on this would have been better.
- A lecture series or speaker about interdisciplinary collaboration with real opportunities to brain storm look for collaborative partners
- More “take home” points.
- I had trouble hearing and understanding Dr. Moody in the last part of the session.
- These are very valuable and important topics to get across; however this presenter did not provide enough structure for a productive and valuable learning session.
- More introductory remarks from the presenter would have been useful to frame/inform group discussion.
- Perhaps include actual role plays of the scenarios or activities presented (active participation).
- Acoustics of room need improvement.
- I cannot make any suggestions since this is my first FORWARD lecture.
- A luncheon on the mechanics and responsibilities of advising would be beneficial for all.
- Audience participation is useful, but not for the majority of the time—I came here to learn from the speaker who didn’t deliver.
- Vary day of week (T/Th vs. MWF) for those of us that teach over noon hour.
- More practical ways of dealing with these very important and very difficult issues.
- More workshops.
- Screen the speaker first.
- Speaker should be screened to make sure that a quality seminar will be delivered.

4. Please provide any additional comments you have about today’s lecture and/or the FORWARD program in general below or on the back of this page.

- The document was too “full” of stereotypes—If would have been more useful to have more ambiguous situation.
- Would have liked more faculty accountability in the scenario discussion—racism is a systemic issue that requires reflection and change. This seemed to focus on a person of color and what they need to do different while it is the system with the larger issue/problem.
- At least this did not overlap with most of the others.
- Handout is useful.
- [illegible] reading, better structured speaker.
- Not worth my time.
- Listing athletic performance as the second point as an example of interferences (second handout) –despite the discussion—seems to be an affect (& stereotype). What did she tell us that we should not have known before today?
- More opportunity to learn and meet others.
- It was a little frustrating to be told to check other websites/sources to find the info instead of being given concrete ideas.
- Prefer the presentation format rather than table group work.
- Please don’t assign tables again. I don’t get to see colleagues that often and I hoped to have some time with them.
- Complete waste of time. Waste of FORWARD money.
- More time was needed to read the 2nd document before meaningful discussion could take place.
- Too much time was allowed for group discussion, thus rushing the end.
- I liked the problem-based approach but would have liked some information from the expert/speaker.
- I lost today 3hours, and learned almost nothing. Lunch should be healthier.
- I couldn’t see the speaker as she moved to the far side of the room. Being up on the stage helps to command people’s attention.