

**Dr. Pamela Lutgen-Sandvik, Associate Professor**  
***Bullying in Academia: Different Forms, Similar Features***  
**December 9<sup>th</sup>, 2013**

Attendance

- One hundred and five individuals attended the training and 83 completed evaluations.
  - 64 (77.1%) identified as faculty, 10 (12.0%) identified as administrators, three (3.6%) participants identified as staff, two (2.4%) identified as faculty from another institution, and four (4.8%) did not respond to the question.

Quantitative Results from the Evaluation Form

**My understanding of what bullying is has increased as a result of attending this lecture.**

	Frequency	Percent	Cumulative Percent
Strongly Disagree	2	2.4	2.4
Disagree	1	1.2	3.7
2.50	1	1.2	4.9
Agree	37	44.6	50.0
Strongly Agree	41	49.4	100.0
Missing Data	1	1.2	
Total	83	100.0	

**My understanding of how bullying affects teaching and learning has increased as a result of attending this lecture.**

	Frequency	Percent	Cumulative Percent
Strongly Disagree	1	1.2	1.2
Disagree	4	4.8	6.2
2.50	1	1.2	7.4
Agree	42	50.6	59.3
Strongly Agree	32	38.6	98.8
N/A	1	1.2	100.0
Missing Data	2	2.4	
Total	83	100.0	

**I will be able to implement new strategies to address bullying in the academy as a result of my participation in this lecture.**

	Frequency	Percent	Cumulative Percent
Strongly Disagree	2	2.4	2.5
Disagree	11	13.3	16.3
2.50	2	2.4	18.8
Agree	37	44.6	65.0
Strongly Agree	26	31.3	97.5
N/A	2	2.4	100.0
Missing Data	3	3.6	
Total	83	100.0	

**I would recommend this lecture to others**

	Frequency	Percent	Cumulative Percent
Strongly Disagree	1	1.2	1.2
Disagree	5	6.0	7.4
Agree	29	34.9	43.2
3.50	1	1.2	44.4
Strongly Agree	45	54.2	100.0
Missing Data	2	2.4	
Total	83	100.0	

### How would you rate the overall quality of this lecture?

	Frequency	Percent	Cumulative Percent
Below Average	2	2.4	2.6
Average	19	22.9	26.9
3.50	1	1.2	28.2
Above Average	30	36.1	66.7
Excellent	26	31.3	100.0
Missing Data	5	6.0	
Total	83	100.0	

### Qualitative Results from the Evaluation Form

1. What questions about bullying do you still have after attending this lecture? Please list any areas and/or topics that you would like to receive additional information about or that need further clarification.
  - How can we get Dr. Lutgen-Sandvik to give more talks at NDSU? ☺
  - Very helpful, but getting people to actually do something is very hard!
  - I will work on these as a review article.
  - Need an entire presentation on how to address academic bullying.
  - How to be proactive instead of being reactive to such undesirable behaviors?
  - I love to hear pedagogical luncheons on the pros and cons of academic tenure.
  - What is the line between scientific disagreement and bullying? The example used was in regards to the merit of one's research. Was the speaker suggesting that this is not allowed in research? Some might consider this as scientific scrutiny while others might consider it bullying.
  - Not completely clear how to distinguish bullying from criticism when it is subtle! (ISI example was confusing.)
  - What are the effective methods, and examples of how to deal with bullying.
  - I still think addressing bullying in academia is extremely difficult because bullying can be done in subtle ways that are difficult to 'prove.'
  - More actual examples, both extremes, would have been additionally informative.
  - How can you prevent this from continuing? How to respond to it?
  - Still looking for proactive approaches for prevention.
  - Management strategies.
  - Strategies for extinguishing bullying.
  - More tips on dealing with bullies – she just got to that at the end.
  - I have done research/written on horizontal violence, which I call girl bullying grown up. Very similar issue/terms/effects. Do you use this term? Have you read Dr. Carol Funk's article Cutting Down the Tall Poppies?
  - What is bullying? Does "negative" talk ever lead to positive outcomes?
  - How do you intervene as a bystander with the lowest academic standing (probationary)?
  - How to suss out when a person looks like a victim (crying, etc.) but feels to others like an aggressor – using sadness and a sense of victimhood to get privileges or special treatment. How to turn back subtle shunning even shunning we realize we might have participated in because we didn't fully respect a colleague?
  - More specific examples on the forms of bullying in academia and how it relates to the fact that faculty need to evaluate quality etc. (example of ISI journals).
  - Bullies may find themselves socially isolated, which could, in turn, make them feel bullied. How, concretely, can one avoid a difficult person without feeding into this cycle?
  - What to do when bullied? What is the difference between bullying and academic evaluation?
  - I would have loved to see some data to show trends.
  - Bullying from students.
  - Student to student bullying. Bystander training. Conflict resolution.
  - How to deal with bullying. If any department has developed formal procedure addressing bullying.
  - When your boss is the bully – HR and everyone else says there's nothing they can do.
  - How to distinguish constructive criticism vs. bullying?
  - Bullying in the tenure process.
  - Additional ways of dealing with sabotage and passive aggressive behavior – very challenging.
  - More ways to react to bullying to prevent or mitigate it; NDSU needs better policy, especially with junior faculty.

- What should I do if my chair supports the bully and a couple of other faculty members gang up because it suits their selfish interests?
- How do I get an inactive department head to understand and act, as opposed to calling it ‘interpersonal differences’ or ‘disagreement’?
- What can you do besides leaving your job?
- I wonder if we need a lecture on “being inclusive” not referring to all the special groups we usually address but just for the “average” faculty and how to treat each other with dignity and respect.
- I would like to know more about why the bullies bully – what causes this behavior? How is this experience of intimidating and threatening another person rewarding to the bully?

2. What do you think were the most helpful or valuable aspects of the lecture you attended today?

- How academic bullying affects teaching and students. Strategies for dealing with bullies.
- Just starting a discussion of bullying in academia.
- Striking how prevalent it is in academia.
- Excellent use of examples.
- Just the better recognition of what might be considered as bullying.
- Made aware of how commonly people perceive that they are being bullied.
- Defining what bullying is and examples.
- I am more aware of the forms that bullying can take and will be able to recognize it.
- Open discussion about the issue.
- Examples.
- Good examples and conversational presentation.
- Bullying could be made tangible and therefore subjected to improvement.
- Identification of what bullying looks like in academia.
- Her straight talk and handouts on web.
- Google horizontal violence and many articles will come up regarding horizontal violence and nursing profession – Carolyn Hastie articles.
- Bringing this topic to light. The discussion was very good. Pam responded very well to questions afterwards. Really showed she knows her stuff.
- Use collective resistance for most effectiveness.
- All aspects.
- Awareness.
- Informal presentation style.
- How academic bullying is different from what we typically think of.
- Features of not only bullies, but targets and bystanders.
- What we can do – policies, positive reinforcements, and negative sanctioning. The notion of insidious persistence.
- Definition of bullying.
- Better understanding of bullying.
- I would like to see an anti-bully policy at NDSU.
- Bullying in academia is “smart bullying.”
- Becoming aware of the issues.
- The definitions and recognition of bullying.
- Good examples!
- Various criteria, ways to create sanctions.
- Defining bullying on a spectrum.
- Emotions as indicators of bullying.
- Putting a name on aggressive behavior.
- Ideas of policies etc. Examples of what bullying is.
- Overview of various forms of bullying – good examples.
- Synopsis of what happens when faculty are bullied. Many negative impacts - students, negative work environment.
- Dr. Lutgen-Sandvik spoke to problems at NDSU. Hard to hear examples I experience at NDSU.
- Realized that disengagement is part of bullying. Displaced rage.
- The situation/conditions describe verbatim what has happened at NDSU.

- Impact on students. I had kind of sensed that but never phrased it out. But my students do know who to exclude from committees.
  - Q&A – not helpful.
  - It is useful to let everyone know.
  - High ratio in academic bullying.
3. What is one thing you will do differently as a result of attending this lecture?
- Suggest my department formulate a common goals statement.
  - Nothing different.
  - Self-examination.
  - I will be more aware of implicit bullying attempts.
  - In the review process what is valid criticism and what might be considered bullying?
  - Be more vigilant of this behavior.
  - Think more about self-perceptions and experiences.
  - Not sure. I feel I've been a victim of bullying but still don't know what to do about it.
  - Be more aware.
  - Increase awareness.
  - Always try to act when appropriate to help movement.
  - Maybe speak up when I see it. This happens at NDSU more often than people think.
  - Read up on bullying in academia.
  - Think before saying something to subordinates.
  - I think I would be more likely to speak up: "Do you intend that to be bullying? It sounds bullying to me."
  - Be vigilant against bullying. Try to speak up if I see it. Don't just ignore it.
  - Watch for it.
  - Keep my eyes open to this.
  - Don't know, because of lack of standing and lack of other suggestions in talk.
  - Try to redirect negative gossip when possible.
  - Consider specific situations and behavior.
  - Pay more attention on how I behave in my research group.
  - Don't be a bystander.
  - Be more aware of whether bullying is occurring or not.
  - Step in to stop bullying as early as possible.
  - Be more aware of bullying.
  - Be more positive in my home department.
  - Be on the look out for bullying in my department.
  - Be more responsive when I observe bullying.
  - Be positive about others.
  - Say something.
  - Nothing – I still don't know what to do. Some of this behavior is documented, but my chair minimizes this behavior.
  - Be more cautious and outspoken when watching others being bullied. Push for anti-bullying policy in senate.
  - No bullying to others.
  - Always be nice. 😊
4. How could the FORWARD lecture series be improved to be more beneficial to you? What recommendations do you have for future lectures?
- More on effective workplace communication (like this one).
  - One of the best FORWARD lectures yet.
  - More emphasis on teaching pedagogy rather than focus on workplace interactions (I realize the other aspects are important, but it seems they are over emphasized).
  - No ideas, but this presentation was better than most.
  - More variety of time/days for the lectures.
  - More straight talk like this on topics that are the elephant in the room.
  - Do this again periodically. She's a great and knowledgeable presenter.

- Better lunches (no more salad bars!) More lectures with concrete recommendations for action.
  - Have people from other universities too.
  - I would love a lecture about bullying and students. The students I work with have a feeling of entitlement and getting into my selective admission major. Bullying with grades.
  - Advisor training.
  - Good job! Continue to have lunch with lectures.
  - This is perhaps the most important pedagogical workshop I have attended – should be a required course.
  - Have mandatory training for department heads. Survey on bullying and NDSU – make data conceivable.
  - See above [I wonder if we need a lecture on “being inclusive” not referring to all the special groups we usually address but just for the “average” faculty and how to treat each other with dignity and respect].
  - Put on NDSU event calendar.
5. Please provide any additional comments you have about today’s lecture and/or the FORWARD program in general below or on the back of this page.
- Great talk! Thanks!
  - [Notes on back of page] Collegiality as a fourth area of tenure/promotion? Implicit. It seems possible that in ND – many state institutions are politically bullied, withholding of resources, etc. “Don’t tenure the permissive outcome of bullying?” meaning: the candidate. NDSU, by one prominent external source, is in need of 175 faculty? Are faculty being bullied because they are overworked? And then we bully because we are over-worked.
  - Didn’t address the issue of advisors bullying students.
  - I see bullying increasing as research expectations increase. Thus, one reason bullying is more prevalent in higher education is our structure, which is based upon specific forms of power.
  - I’m delighted that Dr. Lutgen-Sandvik has come to NDSU!
  - More data would help to appreciate more. Also, please bring in others’ work.
  - Speaker is excellent – but should avoid using the names of her colleagues, even if in jest.
  - I think this would be a great lecture for staff to hear too.
  - This happened to me and I ended up changing departments!
  - All administrators should attend.
  - The bullies/people in power in the department did not actually attend this – so it will have minimal impact.
  - Speaker avoided answering [illegible].
  - BORING.
  - [Responding to quantitative question about ability to implement strategies as a result of training with ‘disagree’] This became an animated conversation in the question and answer but it deserves to be part of the presentation program.
  - [Responding to quantitative question about understanding bullying] Already know a lot from personal experience.
  - [Responding to quantitative question about effects of bullying] Agree with effect on advisory committees.
  - [Responding to quantitative question about implementing strategies as a result of training] Help push anti-bullying policy.